Finite Multiplicative Subgroups of a Field

Let $G \subset F^*$ be a finite group. There are several ways to prove that $G$ is cyclic. All proofs are based on the fact that the equation $x^d = 1$ can have at most $d$ solutions in a field $F$.

**Proof (I)** Use the structure theorem for finite abelian groups. If $|G| = n$ and $G$ is not cyclic, then the structure theorem yields the existence of $d < n$ so that $x^d = 1$ for all $x \in G$. Contradiction.

**Proof (II)** First give an elementary argument that if $G$ is a finite abelian group and $x, y \in G$, then there exists $z \in G$ so that $|z| = \text{lcm}(|x|, |y|)$. Namely, if the orders of $x$ and $y$ are relatively prime, take $z = xy$. Otherwise, look at the prime power factorizations of the orders of $x$ and $y$. Any divisor of $|x|$ will be the order of some power of $x$, since $\langle x \rangle$ is a cyclic group. So, you find $z$ as a product of various powers of $x$ and $y$, corresponding to the various maximal prime power factors of $|x|$ and $|y|$, as in the relatively prime case. It then follows that for a finite abelian group $G$ there is an integer $d$ so that $G$ contains an element of order $d$ and $x^d = 1$ for all $x$ in $G$. Hence, if $x^d = 1$ has at most $d$ solutions then $G$ is cyclic.

**Proof (III)** Suppose $G$ is a finite group so that for each integer $d$ the equation $x^d = 1$ has at most $d$ solutions in $G$. Then, even without assuming $G$ abelian at the outset, you can prove $G$ is cyclic. Namely, first of all any cyclic group of order $m$ has exactly $\phi(s)$ elements of order $s$, for each divisor $s$ of $m$, where $\phi(s)$ is the Euler phi function. (A consequence is the Euler formula $m = \sum_{s|m} \phi(s)$, the sum taken over the divisors $s$ of $m$.) Now, back to our group $G$. For a given divisor $d$ of $n = |G|$, either group $G$ has no element of order $d$, or it has at least one, in which case $G$ contains a cyclic group of order $d$, which, by hypothesis, must contain all solutions of $x^d = 1$ in $G$. Thus, in this case, $G$ contains exactly $\phi(d)$ elements of order $d$. Now, we know $|G| = n = \sum_{d|n} \phi(d)$, the sum over the divisors of $n$, by the Euler result. But all elements of $G$ have some order $d$ which divides $n$, and it is impossible that any order $d \mid n$ is “left out”, since there are either 0 or $\phi(d)$ elements of order $d$ in $G$. The sum would not add up to $n$ if 0 ever occurred. In particular, $G$ contains elements of order $n$. 
